

em.jema.2b578.81b1a5.82857b8d 代表 Toan Trinh

发给 zlj@lreis.ac.cn

2023-03-01 10:50 隐藏信息

发件人:

em.jema.2b578.81b1a5.82857b8d <em.jema.2b578.81b1a5.82857b8d@editorialmanager.com> 代表
Toan Trinh <em@editorialmanager.com>

收件人: zlj@lreis.ac.cn <zlj@lreis.ac.cn>

时间: 2023年3月1日 (周三) 10:50

大小: 18 KB

Ms. Ref. No.: JEMA-D-23-01828

Title: From scenario to roadmap: A web-based participatory watershed planning system for optimizing multistage implementation plans of management practice scenario under stepwise investment

Journal of Environmental Management

Dear Dr. Zhu,

Following this message are the reviews of the above-referenced manuscript. We'll be glad to consider this paper for publication after it's been revised in accordance with the reviewers' comments.

Due to space limitations in the printed journal, we are requesting that all authors reduce the length of their papers by at least 10% if possible. If your paper includes large tables or datasets, it is preferred that these be published as supplementary material in Science Direct rather than in print. Further information is provided at the end of this message.

With the revised manuscript, please provide a detailed response to the reviewers' comments, indicating how each comment is addressed in the revised manuscript. If you disagree with any of the reviewers' comments, please address them in a rebuttal.

To submit a revision, please go to <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jema/> and login as an Author.

Your username is: zlj@lreis.ac.cn

If you need to retrieve password details, please go to: [click here to reset your password](#)

NOTE: Upon submitting your revised manuscript, please upload the source files for your article. For additional details regarding acceptable file formats, please refer to the Guide for Authors at: <http://www.elsevier.com/journals/journal-of-environmental-management/0301-4797/guide-for-authors>

When submitting your revised paper, we ask that you include the following items:

Manuscript and Figure Source Files (mandatory)

We cannot accommodate PDF manuscript files for production purposes. We also ask that when submitting your revision you follow the journal formatting guidelines. Figures and tables may be embedded within the source file for the submission as long as they are of sufficient resolution for Production. For any figure that cannot be embedded within the source file (such as *.PSD Photoshop files), the original figure needs to be uploaded separately. Refer to the Guide for Authors for additional information.

<http://www.elsevier.com/journals/journal-of-environmental-management/0301-4797/guide-for-authors>

Highlights (mandatory)

Highlights consist of a short collection of bullet points that convey the core findings of the article and should be submitted in a separate file in the online submission system. Please use 'Highlights' in the file name and include 3 to 5 bullet points (maximum 85 characters, including spaces, per bullet point). See the following website for more information <http://www.elsevier.com/highlights>

Graphical Abstract (optional)

Graphical Abstracts should summarize the contents of the article in a concise, pictorial form designed to capture the attention of a wide readership online. Refer to the following website for more information: <http://www.elsevier.com/graphicalabstracts>

On your Main Menu page is a folder entitled "Submissions Needing Revision". You will find your submission record there.

Please note that this journal offers a new, free service called AudioSlides: brief, webcast-style presentations that are shown next to published articles on ScienceDirect (see also <http://www.elsevier.com/audioslides>). If your paper is accepted for publication, you will automatically receive an invitation to create an AudioSlides presentation.

Journal of Environmental Management features the Interactive Plot Viewer, see: <http://www.elsevier.com/interactiveplots>. Interactive Plots provide easy access to the data behind plots. To include one with your article, please prepare a .csv file with your plot data and test it online at <http://authortools.elsevier.com/interactiveplots/verification> before submission as supplementary material.

PLEASE NOTE: The journal would like to enrich online articles by visualising and providing geographical details described in Journal of Environmental Management articles. For this purpose, corresponding KML (GoogleMaps) files can be uploaded in our online submission system. Submitted KML files will be published with your online article on ScienceDirect. Elsevier will generate maps from the KML files and include them in the online article.

The revised version of your submission is due by 03-21-2023.

Research Elements (optional)

This journal encourages you to share research objects - including your raw data, methods, protocols, software, hardware and more – which support your original research article in a Research Elements journal. Research Elements are open access, multidisciplinary, peer-reviewed journals which make the objects associated with your research more discoverable, trustworthy and promote replicability and reproducibility. As open access journals, there may be an Article Publishing Charge if your paper is accepted for publication. Find out more about the Research Elements journals at https://www.elsevier.com/authors/tools-and-resources/research-elements-journals?dgcid=ec_em_research_elements_email.

Yours sincerely,

Toan Trinh, Ph.D
Associate Editor
Journal of Environmental Management

While submitting the revised manuscript, please double check the author names provided in the submission so that authorship related changes are made in the revision stage. If your manuscript is

accepted, any authorship change will involve approval from co-authors and respective editor handling the submission and this may cause a significant delay in publishing your manuscript.

P.S. Elsevier now accepts electronic supplementary material to support and enhance your scientific research. Supplementary files offer the author additional possibilities to publish supporting applications, movies, animation sequences, high-resolution images, background datasets, sound clips and more. Supplementary files supplied will be published online alongside the electronic version of your article on Science Direct at <http://www.sciencedirect.com>. In order to ensure that your submitted material is directly usable, please ensure that data are provided in one of our recommended file formats. Authors should submit the material in electronic format together with the article and supply a concise and descriptive caption for each file. For more detailed instructions please visit our artwork instruction pages at the Elsevier Corporate Website at <http://www.elsevier.com/artworkinstructions>.

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: 1. This article proposes a web-based participatory planning system for optimizing a multistage implementation plan that can assist decision-making in watershed planning, but it reads more like a manual for information software than the literature on environmental management.

2.This article uses a case study of decision-making for soil erosion control in a small agricultural watershed as an example. Still, it is not necessary because such a case is too simple. The readers would wonder why such decision-making information support and network information sharing are required. The authors should let us realize the necessity of using such a decision-making system in a realistic policy-forming mechanism.

3.The participatory watershed planning system proposed in this article is very suitable as a platform for distance learning of environmental management-related courses. Under the teacher's guidance, students can present decision-making thinking based on the simulations from this system, which can become excellent case studies for educational research papers but less impressive contributions as papers in environmental management.

4.This research adopts a multistage BMP implementation plan for decision-making of optimization. However, as we see, the content is only a scenario exercise of information simulation and lacks a test evaluation for potential users. So far, the existing research content needs to convince us of the practicability of this information system.

5.The authors should conduct a systematic analysis of this information system to analyze which parts are necessary and which parts must be adjusted according to environmental management needs so that readers can refer to their research.

Reviewer #5: 1.New contributions in field of optimization technique aren't clear.

2.Highlights are weak.Graphical abstract needs to improve.

3.Abstract has to rewrite by focusing on new results.

4.Introduction shall modify.Authors didn't explain benefit of optimization process.No indication to comparative methods of optimization techniques.I propose to see reference:

"A hybrid optimization framework for road traffic accident data", International Journal of Crashworthines Taylor&Francis, Vol.24, No.6, 2019.

5.Section 2.3 is weak.Fig.4 needs to improve.

6.Formulating of optimization problems shall explain.

7.Fig.5 isn't clear.Fig.6 is unmeaning.

8.Discussion of Fig.8 has conflicted conclusions.

9.Fig.9: No validation for optimal results.

10. Conclusions shall rewrite by explanation of new contributions when compared with the previous works.

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

#AU_JEMA#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. ([Remove my information/details](#)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.